

CITY OF ALAMEDA
HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
RESOLUTION HAB-21-01

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL, PLN20-0431, FOR THE DEMOLITION OF TWO MAIN BUILDINGS (BUILDINGS 1 AND 2) AND FOUR ACCESSORY STRUCTURES (BUILDINGS 8, 9, 10, AND 13) WITHIN THE ALAMEDA FEDERAL CENTER SITE AT 620 CENTRAL AVENUE

WHEREAS, the applicant, Alameda Point Collaborative, made an application on December 22, 2020, for a Certificate of Approval for the demolition of two main buildings (Buildings 1 and 2 (including Buildings 2A, 2B, 2C, and 2D)) and four accessory structures (Building Nos. 8, 9, 10, and 13) on a 3.65-acre portion of the Alameda Federal Center property located at 620 Central Avenue; and

WHEREAS, the application was deemed complete on February 15, 2021; and

WHEREAS, the Alameda Federal Center property is listed on the Alameda Historical Building Study List with an “s” category designation; and

WHEREAS, pursuant to Alameda Municipal Code (AMC) Section 13-21.7, the demolition of the structures on a property listed on the Historical Building Study List requires a Certificate of Approval by the Historical Advisory Board; and

WHEREAS, the Historical Advisory Board conducted a duly noticed public hearing on May 6, 2021 and examined the entirety of the record, including all submitted materials and public comments regarding the application.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, in December 2018, the City Council by Resolution No. 15461 adopted a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) and Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) in compliance with CEQA for the McKay Wellness Center (Alameda Federal Center Reuse Project). In accordance with Section 15164 of the CEQA Guidelines, an Addendum to the Mitigated Negative Declaration has been prepared in the manner required and as authorized under CEQA, and the Historical Advisory Board has considered the MND, MMRP and Addendum, all of which are incorporated by reference as though fully set forth herein, prior to making a decision on the Certificate of Approval application. The Historical Advisory Board finds and determines that approval of the Certificate of Approval application does not raise important new issues about the potentially significant impacts on the environment that have not been previously disclosed in the MND and no further environmental review is required; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board has made the following findings relative to the Certificate of Approval request:

1. Site: The April 28, 2021 memorandum from Page & Turnbull confirmed the conclusions of a 1996 historic evaluation that the subject buildings (Building

1 and Building 2 and accessory buildings 8, 9, 10, and 13) were either built after the site's historic period of significance (1942-1957) or have lost considerable integrity of design, materials, setting, feeling, and association with the period of significance through demolitions and redevelopment of the original training facility on adjacent parcels, and significant alterations to the existing buildings. The demolition of southern wings of Building 2 within the subject parcel, and Buildings 3, 4, 5 and 6 in the neighboring parcel, have led to an additional loss of integrity of the complex since Page & Turnbull's 1996 evaluation. The subject buildings on the subject 3.65-acre parcel are unable to convey their significant associations with either their historic use as the Maritime Service Officers School, or as an architectural example of a modern campus. They do not convey the special nature of this property's historic maritime training mission during and after World War II, or yield scientific or historic information to future researchers. Page & Turnbull concludes that the heavily modified buildings and accessory structures do not retain sufficient integrity of setting, location, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, or association to be considered a historic resource.

2. Buildings 1 and 2: Building 1 and Building 2 (including Buildings 2A, 2B, 2C, and 2D), located at 620 Central Avenue / 1245 McKay Avenue were originally constructed in 1942-1943 as part of the Maritime Service Officers School, Alameda. They were later part of a group of buildings referred to as the Alameda Federal Center, leased by various federal agencies beginning in the late 1960s. Both have been significantly altered in the nearly seven decades since the closure of the school in 1953. Page & Turnbull reviewed existing documentation regarding buildings within the subject property to provide its opinion of their eligibility for historic resource designation at the national, state, and local levels. Based on the lack of integrity of the original Maritime Service Officers School campus as a whole, and the lack of individual integrity of each of these buildings, they are not eligible for listing on the National Register, California Register, on the Alameda Historic Monuments List, or on the Historical Building Study List at any level.
3. Accessory Buildings 8, 9, 10, 13: Four additional accessory buildings within the 3.65-acre parcel, Buildings 8, 9, 10 and 13, are not directly associated with the operation of the Maritime Service Officer's School, and do not possess significance in their own right.
4. Approval of the Certificate of Approval would not result in the demolition of a historically significant building or structure. Although the property is listed on the Alameda Historical Building Study List, the subject buildings (Building 1 and Building 2 (including Buildings 2A, 2B, 2C and 2D) and Accessory Buildings 8, 9, 10 and 13) are not historic resources under CEQA (as defined by Public Resources Code section 21084.1). Said buildings have been evaluated and the preponderance of the evidence demonstrates that the subject buildings are not historically or culturally significant.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board hereby approves the Certificate of Approval to allow the demolition of the two main buildings (Buildings 1 and 2 (including Buildings 2A, 2B, 2C and 2D)) and four accessory buildings (Buildings 8, 9, 10, and 13) subject to the following conditions:

- (1) This Certificate of Approval shall expire three (3) years after the date of approval or by May 6, 2024, unless demolition has begun under valid City permits prior to the date of expiration. This Certificate of Approval may be extended by the Planning Director for up to (2) additional years from the date of expiration upon submittal of an extension request and the associated fee.
- (2) This Certificate of Approval is not a Demolition Permit. The applicant shall separately apply for a demolition permit issued by the Building Official.
- (3) Prior to issuance of a demolition permit for the first main building (Building 1 or Building 2), the applicant shall first obtain Design Review approval by the City for a replacement building.
- (4) Mitigation Measures Required Prior to Demolition. Prior to issuance of any demolition/ building permits or certificate of occupancy, the applicant shall demonstrate compliance with the McKay Wellness Center Project Mitigation Measures Air Quality AQ-1, Biological Resources BR-1, Cultural Resources CR-1, CR-2, CR-3, CR-4, Geology and Soils GS-1, Hazardous Materials HM-1, HM-2, Water Quality WQ-1, WQ-2, WQ-3, as applicable.

INDEMNIFICATION. To the maximum extent permitted by law, the applicant (or its successor in interest) shall defend (with counsel acceptable to the City), indemnify, and hold harmless the City of Alameda, its City Council, City Planning Board, officials, employees, agents and volunteers (collectively, "Indemnitees") from and against any and all claims, actions, or proceedings against Indemnitees to attack, set aside, void or annul an approval by Indemnitees relating to this project. This indemnification shall include, but is not limited to, all damages, losses, and expenses (including, without limitation, legal costs and attorney's fees) that may be awarded to the prevailing party arising out of or in connection with an approval by the Indemnitees relating to this project. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any claim, action or proceeding and the City shall cooperate in the defense. The City may elect, in its sole discretion, to participate in the defense of said claim, action, or proceeding and the applicant (or its successor in interest) shall reimburse the City for its reasonable legal costs and attorneys' fees.

NOTICE. No judicial proceedings subject to review pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.5 may be prosecuted more than ninety (90) days following the date of this decision plus extensions authorized by California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.6

NOTICE. The conditions of project approval set forth herein include certain fees and other exactions. Pursuant to Government Code Section 66020 (d) (1), these Conditions constitute

written notice of a statement of the amount of such fees, and a description of the dedications, reservations and exactions. The applicant is hereby further notified that the 90-day appeal period, in which the applicant may protest these fees and other exactions, pursuant to Government Code Section 66020 (a) has begun. If the applicant fails to file a protest within this 90-day period complying with all requirements of Section 66020, the applicant will be legally barred from later challenging such fees or exactions.

NOTICE. The decision of the Historical Advisory Board shall be final unless appealed to the City Council, in writing and within ten (10) days of the decision, by filing with the Planning Building and Transportation Department a written notice of appeal stating the basis of appeal and paying the required fees

* * * * *

I, the undersigned, hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was duly and regularly adopted and passed by the Historical Advisory Board of the City of Alameda during the Regular Meeting of the Historical Advisory Board on the 6th day of May, 2021, by the following vote to wit:

AYES: (4) Jones, Wit, Lau, and Sanchez
NOES: (1) Saxby
ABSENT: (0)

ATTEST:



Allen Tai, Secretary
City of Alameda Historical Advisory
Board

CITY OF ALAMEDA
HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
RESOLUTION HAB-21-02

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL PLN21-0468 TO ALLOW THE CONVERSION OF THE LAWN AT CITY HALL TO DROUGHT TOLERANT LANDSCAPING.

WHEREAS, on February 3, 1976, the City Council of the City of Alameda designated City Hall at 2263 Santa Clara Avenue as a Historic Monument; and

WHEREAS, Alameda City Hall is listed on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) as an individual resource; and

WHEREAS, Governor Newsom of the State of California issued a Proclamation of a State of Emergency due to the ongoing drought in California and called for voluntary reductions in water consumption to prepare for and mitigate the effects of drought conditions; and

WHEREAS, on September 7, 2021, the City Council directed staff to implement a number of water conservation efforts, including converting the lawns that surround City Hall and City Hall West to drought tolerant landscapes.

WHEREAS, on October 4, 2021, the Public Works Department of the City of Alameda applied for a Certificate of Approval to convert the lawn at City Hall to a drought-tolerant landscape plan; and

WHEREAS, the Historical Advisory Board conducted a duly noticed public hearing on December 2, 2021 and examined the entirety of the record, including all submitted materials and public comments regarding the application.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Advisory Board finds that the project is Categorically Exempt from additional environmental review pursuant to California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15304(b) – Minor Alterations to Land, which consists of new gardening or landscaping, including the replacement of existing landscaping with water-efficient landscaping; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board finds that this project meets the standards established by the Historical Advisory Board and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, as follows:

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.**

This project consists of the replacement of existing lawn and associated landscaping with drought-tolerant landscaping to reduce water consumption. No new use is proposed.

- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.**

The project proposed to replace existing lawn and associated landscaping with drought-tolerant landscaping. While specific plants will be removed and replaced and the configuration of the landscape may be different than existing, the proportions or spatial relationships of these elements are being preserved. Where lawn currently exists as a low-profile groundcover and is a character-defining feature of the historic landscaping, the low-profile appearance will be maintained through the use of similar low-profile plants.

- 3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.**

No conjectural features or architectural elements from other historic properties are proposed for this project.

- 4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.**

There are no alterations to the any other features that have acquired historic significance over time.

- 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.**

Where lawn currently exists as a low-profile groundcover and is a character-defining feature of the historic landscaping, the low-profile appearance will be maintained through the use of similar low-profile plants. Existing spatial relationships between the building and surrounding landscaping will be preserved.

- 6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.**

This project consists of the replacement of existing lawn and associated landscaping with drought-tolerant landscaping to reduce water consumption. Where

lawn currently exists as a low-profile groundcover and is a character-defining feature of the historic landscaping, the low-profile appearance will be maintained through the use of similar low-profile plants. Existing spatial relationships between the building and surrounding landscaping will be preserved.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

No chemical or physical treatments are proposed for this project.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

The project will not disturb any archeological resources.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

No additions for habitable space are proposed for this project.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

No adjacent new construction shall be undertaken as part of this project.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board hereby approves a Certificate of Approval to convert the existing City Hall lawn to drought tolerant landscaping and delegates the Public Works Director to implement a landscape plan consistent with EBMUD and Bay-Friendly/Rescape guidelines, subject to the following conditions:

1. Prior to implementing the lawn conversion, the Public Works Department shall revise the final landscape plan to include the following:
 - a. Potential for additional seating areas (benches) along the Santa Clara and Oak Street frontages for the public.
 - b. Either expand the public gathering around or provide durable ground cover planting that can accommodate City Hall public assembly that may overflow from the paved circle into the landscape area.
 - c. Provide landscape maintenance instructions for maintenance staff.

* * * * *

I, the undersigned, hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was duly and regularly adopted and passed by the Historical Advisory Board of the City of Alameda during the Regular Meeting of the Historical Advisory Board on the 2nd day of December, 2021, by the following vote to wit:

AYES: (5) Saxby, Lau, Jones, Wit, and Sanchez

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (0)

ATTEST:



Allen Tai, Secretary
City of Alameda Historical Advisory
Board

CITY OF ALAMEDA
HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
RESOLUTION HAB-21-03

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA
APPROVING THE REPLACEMENT OF HISTORIC STREETLIGHTS

WHEREAS, in 1987, the City Council of the City of Alameda designated 1,297 streetlights across Alameda as Historic Monuments;

WHEREAS, on October 4, 2012, the Historical Advisory Board approved a Certificate of Approval to allow the removal and replacement of 700 16-flute historic streetlights to be phased over time; and

WHEREAS, on November 16, 2021, the Public Works Department of the City of Alameda requested subsequent approval of approximately 205 Smooth Pole Pendant and 236 Octo-Fluted Pendent Streetlights with approved replica designs; and

WHEREAS, the Historical Advisory Board conducted a duly noticed public hearing on December 2, 2021 and examined the entirety of the record, including all submitted materials and public comments regarding the application.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Advisory Board finds that the project is Categorically Exempt from additional environmental review pursuant to California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15331 - Historical Resource Rehabilitation, which applies to maintenance, repair, rehabilitation, restoration, or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board finds that the proposed project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards in that:

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.**

This project consists of the replacement of historic streetlights with replica streetlights with modern materials. No new use is proposed.

- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.**

The overall height, the shrouds and the detailing of the arms are being preserved to the extent possible in this project. In addition, the proportions or spatial relationships of these elements are being preserved to the extent possible as well.

- 3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not**

be undertaken.

No conjectural features or architectural elements from other historic properties are proposed for this project.

- 4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.**

There are no alterations to the historic streetlights that have acquired historic significance over time.

- 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.**

Fabrication of the aluminum poles ensures the flutes, proportions and decorative nut covers of the light poles are being preserved to the extent possible. The shrouds and arms are being preserved to the extent possible, while ensuring that they are safely constructed.

- 6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.**

Unfortunately, repair of the historic streetlights is not feasible as much of the existing steel is significantly rusted and structurally compromised. There are also a number of missing pole locations, having been knocked down by a vehicle. However, a significant effort has been made to have the proposed streetlights match their historic predecessors in terms of design and texture.

- 7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.**

No chemical or physical treatments are proposed for this project.

- 8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.**

Minimal ground excavation for pole foundations will be part of the project. If any archeological resources are discovered, all required state and local mitigation measures will be undertaken.

- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.**

No additions for habitable space are proposed for this project.

- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.**

No adjacent new construction shall be undertaken as part of this project.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board approves a Certificate of Approval to replace approximately 205 Smooth Pole Pendant and 236 Octo-Fluted Pendant Streetlights with the approved replica designs subject to the following conditions:

- (1) The scope of work shall be in substantial compliance with details and specifications contained in the staff report and Exhibit 2 of December 2, 2021 and on file in the office of the City of Alameda Planning Department.
- (2) The Public Works Department shall document the reason(s) for replacing any individual historic streetlight prior to its actual replacement.

I, the undersigned, hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was duly and regularly adopted and passed by the Historical Advisory Board of the City of Alameda during the Regular Meeting of the Historical Advisory Board on the 2nd day of December, 2021, by the following vote to wit:

AYES: (5) Saxby, Jones, Lau, Wit, and Sanchez

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (0)

ATTEST:



Allen Tai, Secretary
City of Alameda Historical Advisory
Board